

Results of research of corruption`s problem in the health care system of Tatarstan

Irina Ivanovna Frolova¹, Leysan Mudarisovna Zakirova², Landish Mudarisovna Khamitova¹

¹Institute of Economics, Management and Law (Kazan) branch in Naberezhnye Chelny, Naberezhnochelinskaya street, 31, Naberezhnye Chelny, 423810, Russia

²Branch of Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University in Naberezhnye Chelny, Mira Street, 68/19, Naberezhnye Chelny, 423810, Russia

Abstract. One of the important components of the living standards is health. The population health is an important indicator of socio-economic development of modern society. The health indicators of the population depend on the quality of medical aid and level of development of the health care system at the modern stage. Medical assistance in state and municipal institutions of health care provides to citizens free, at the expense of the appropriate budget, insurance premiums and other proceeds. There are acts of public law and order in the public health, that is, everything is prohibited, except prescribed, or allowed only what the law expressly provided. In other words, the law is manifested according to its public institutions. Health indicators of the population depend on the quality of medical care. A large share of corruption observed in the sphere of health, conducted a number of studies on issues of corruption. Purpose of work is the study of opinions of the population and experts about the forms and manifestations of corruption in the health care sector. Studies were carried out from 2007 to 2013. The results showed that 95% of doctors and 77% of nurses have additional sources of income.

[Frolova I.I., Zakirova L.M., Khamitova L.M. **Results of research of corruption`s problem in the health care system of Tatarstan.** *Life Sci J* 2014;11(11s):398-402] (ISSN:1097-8135). <http://www.lifesciencesite.com>. 90

Keywords: health, health indicators, health care system, medical workers, corruption

Introduction

The development of corruption in Russia negatively affects to the credibility of public authorities, hinders the economic development of the country and reduces the effectiveness of public administration.

One of the important components of the living standards is health. The population health is an important indicator of socio-economic development of modern society. The health indicators of the population depend on the quality of medical aid and level of development of the health care system at the modern stage (Frolova, 2008). In this regard, a large proportion of corruption is observed in the field of health.

The existing Constitution of the Russian Federation (in terms of article 41) stipulates that everyone has the right to health protection and medical assistance. In conditions of reforming of the Russian economic system the enforcement in medical practice were faced with a dilemma: either to delegate the resolution of disputes concerning the merits of medical care forensic medical examination, or to develop a uniform of legal approach to the resolution of such disputes (Frolova, 2013).

Corruption has penetrated all spheres of society, including health care. The value of health care is difficult to overestimate: it allows to achieve such goals as natural population growth, high level of living of all members of society equal opportunities

to meet everyday conditions of life and labour activity of different social strata (Balabanova, 2011). While the prevalence of health-corruption impedes implementation of these tasks, the priority for socio-economic policy of any state.

On the basis and in pursuance of the international legal acts in the Russian Federation adopted a number of Federal and regional laws and regulations on combating corruption (Balabanova, 2011). However, taking into account factors such as constant metamorphic range and a high degree of latency of corruption, to provide a comprehensive and long-term plan of struggle with it to date have not succeeded. Moreover, corruption in health care has a tendency to growth, largely ahead in its development adopted by the state anti-corruption measures.

The topicality of the chosen theme is determined by the fact that the criminological study of corruption in health care, in the first instance, to identify shortcomings in the organization of activities for the protection of health and thereby improve the effectiveness of solutions to the state task on increase in active life expectancy of the population. In addition, a comprehensive consideration of peculiarities of development of corruption in health care is an important step towards increasing the efficiency of government anti-corruption measures aimed not only at preventing the spread of corruption

in society, but in general the preservation of life and health of citizens.

Medical assistance in state and municipal institutions of health care provides to citizens free, at the expense of the appropriate budget (Zakirova, 2010), insurance premiums and other proceeds. There are acts of public law and order in the public health, that is, everything is prohibited, except prescribed, or allowed only what the law expressly provided. In other words, the law is manifested according to its public institutions.

The activities of the non-state medicine are implemented on other legal grounds: everything is allowed that is not forbidden by law. Thus, for the non-state medicine is valid regulations (Zakirova and Dobrotvorskaya, 2012) established by private law. If employees of healthcare institutions as civil servants law (and often departmental instructions) oblige to act, the non-state medical institutions, as for the citizens, the law contains far less regulations and much more consent.

Materials and methods

Since 2007, there have been several studies on the issues of corruption in the health care system. The author's questionnaire is used in the study, which consisted of 30 questions. Respondents answered the questions and expressed their opinions about corruption in health care. In the questionnaire took part: the population, medical staff and experts. The questionnaire was attended by 2000 people.

Results

In 2007, the results of the survey of the population of the cities of Naberezhnye Chelny, Kazan, Nizhnekamsk showed that 74% of respondents gave gifts or handed envelopes with money to workers in the health care system that they received more qualified help. 56% of respondents signed that they had been neglected while the doctor did not receive additional material benefits from the patient or his relatives. 61 % of respondents have resorted to buying certificate of incapacity of work, in most cases, through a friend of medical workers and relatives [6, 7]. The results of a similar survey in 2008 show a slight positive dynamics of the same indices: 76%, 59% and 62% respectively. In 2013, the same indicators remained at the same level: 75%, 60% and 59%. Detailed analysis of the results of the study revealed that the percentage of corruption in the city of Naberezhnye Chelny higher than in Kazan and Nizhnekamsk.

43 % of respondents prefer to give money personally to the doctor, and not through the cash, almost 60 % of them say that it is associated with a reduction in their costs. This is understandable, for

implementation of paid medical services, the contractor receives a small percentage, and the greater part goes to medical and preventive treatment facility. Therefore, doctors welcomed the provision of paid services by cash, by passing the cashier, but for half the price. The survey showed that 95 % of doctors and 77% of medical workers of middle level have additional sources of income in the exercise of medical activity. So, doctors consult at home in their spare time, as well as instrumental and laboratory tests, using the resources of the medical treatment facility.

Most corruption offences committed at the level of "doctor-patient" or close to it. This presents some difficulty as to interdict the legislator should, being at the highest hierarchical level to adopt anti-corruption programs aimed at regulation of activities carried out on the closest to the patient level (Salagai, 2009). It is at this level who allocates 4 major corruption in the health sector: bribery, theft, bureaucratic or political corruption and misinformation with the purpose of personal gain (Salagai, 2009).

Medical workers want to get a decent wage, but most of them are not ready to work in a new way. In the eyes of potential clients the stereotype of model of medical worker is formed. For example, the medical staff middle management takes a niche in the provision of paid medical services, and, consequently, earns additional income. Especially it concerns nurses procedural, manipulation and massage rooms, as well as those who sit at the reception together with the doctors, gynecologists, urologists, dentists and other specialists of narrow specialties. In 2007, 43% of the respondents indicated that, in addition to the doctor, they also thanked the nurse. Unlike money thanks to the doctors (65%) in envelopes, nurses in most cases (91 %) recognition of their "good work" had a material form (candy, wine, food, etc). In 2013 the material form of remuneration of nurses has decreased to 65% against 83% in 2008. Consequently, the interest in cash remuneration has a stable growth.

Commercialization of Healthcare Service, on the one hand, increases the responsibility of medical workers for the quality of rendered services, on the other, demands the creation of robust mechanisms for the protection of the rights of consumers of medical services. However, actually the quality of medical services is not improving - so say 34% of respondents who received medical care for money. 21 % of respondents had tried to protect their interests in connection with poor quality provision of medical services, but the positive result was not achieved.

Discussion

Professional group of medical workers is its autonomy, where there is mutual protection for the mistakes of each other. 91% of survey respondents admit that they never will testify in court against his colleagues, only 9 % of the doubt.

32 % of doctors admit that they are ready to accept gifts and money from the population as a reward, 51% do not deny the fact of receiving gifts and money from grateful patients. For 27% of medical workers additional sources of income are the main. In 2008, 34% of the surveyed physicians said that additional sources of income is their main concern, and 56% said Yes, that was taken from patients gifts. In 2013, these figures tend to increase: for 42% of physicians and 62% of nurses bribes and donations are the main source of income. Experts have identified the following concepts associated with corruption in the health sector: abuse of official position (85%), corruption (75%), fraud (55%), theft (35%), and bribery (30%).

Most people working in the field of health work honestly. Doctors save lives and preserve health. However, there are strong indications of violation of medical ethics: bribery and fraud in the provision of medical services, which undermine the authority of all health workers in the public eye. Half of the experts clearly indicated this type of fraud in the provision of health services, treatment nonexistent disease. Patients trust the doctor, give a lot of money for allegedly difficult to treat disease. Especially it is practiced in urology, gynecology, and in the treatment of diseases of the nervous system.

More than half of the respondents (65%) believe that corruption in health care in recent years, 25% - remained on the same level, only 10 % think it has decreased. Most experts identified the following forms of corruption in the health sector:

- Corruption in public procurement (involvement in the conspiracy, bribery and receiving kickbacks).
- Embezzlement and misappropriation of funds allocated on public health, or income received payments from consumers.
- Corruption in the organization of payments (free service privileged patients, forgery of insurance documents, etc.).
- Development of own business by encouraging doctors for the referral of patients to one or another organization.
- Carrying out unnecessary medical intervention in order to increase its own revenues.
- Corruption in the system of supply of medicines and medical purpose.
- Corruption in institutions providing medical services (extortion or remuneration for

services officially provided free of charge; fees for special privileges or medical services, etc.).

The survey results showed that the rules of organization and holding of competitions on the state purchases of medical equipment and other medical devices are violated in medical institutions - so say 65% of the respondents. At the same time, experts note the presence of a huge abuses in the area of health financing, based on kickbacks to government officials (Frolova, 2013). 55% of respondents believe that corruption in health care is often associated with setting exaggerated accounts of insurance companies.

A third of respondents (35%) noted that in hospitals there is a practice of receiving wages for persons allegedly working in the institution. Experts pay attention to the fact that hospitals are often subordinated to each other are relatives, which prevents effective management and rational organization of activity.

60% of the experts believe that the heads of medical institutions, pharmaceutical companies abuse their powers and steal valuable resources necessary for the effective functioning of the health system.

The majority of respondents (80%) believe that the budgets of the public health systems are used by officials in their personal interests and goals.

According to 55% of respondents, health-care workers often extort additional material goods for free services or special attention.

A serious problem at present is corruption in the pharmaceutical market, which contributes to the development of highly profitable market of counterfeit medicines. 60% of the experts believe that illegal payments at each stage of drug delivery to the consumer ensure unimpeded delivery of fakes from the place of their production to retail sales network.

Representatives of pharmaceutical companies work with physicians, for which an additional fee is prescribed to patients from other drugs, are exactly those that provide pharmaceutical companies with significant annual profit. Especially this kind of business, according to 85% of the experts, thrives in institutions of outpatient type, in which the medical support of individual drugs leads to growth of number of recommendations for their use in the treatment process, not always based on the needs of the patient.

The current situation is due to several reasons. So, from the point of view of the majority of respondents (95%), corruption is flourishing due to the imperfection of laws that contain ambiguous norms, provoking corruption. 75% say the impunity of bribery and corruption of officials at all levels of management. 70% of the experts have identified the reason for the absence of a mechanism of control over the spending of budget funds in the health

sector, and low salaries of the officials, 45% of respondents indicated circular bail bribers.

The doctor, engage in bribery, as a rule, does not resign from work, continuing to work. And those medical institutions which went to the dismissal of its employees, any preventive action against other workers do not accept. In fact, the fact of bribe the paper jams and treatment-and-prophylactic establishment continues to operate as usual. 80% of experts noted that the leaders in the health system ignore the problem of corruption, resulting in employees rarely apply to the authorities and avoid to make this issue for General discussion. Although, more than one third of the respondents pointed out the positive experience in open discussions among colleagues on corruption.

The experts were asked a poll about the most effective measures in the fight against corruption. The results were as follows (the experts had two choices):

- the dismissal of employees who violate ethical norms of conduct in the performance of official duties and a ban on further work in the health system and public administration - 75%;
- improvement of legislative norms - 65%;
- reduction of situations of direct contact of citizens with officials - 40%;
- a significant incentive for impeccable reputation - 20 %.

The overwhelming majority of experts (90%) believe that at present corruption in the health sector cannot eradicate. 70% say that all problems are easily solved in the presence of corruption ties.

Conclusion

In the opinion of the authors in every health facility should:

- To acknowledge the existence of corruption in the health care system and to develop measures to address them.
- To develop mechanisms, this will provide opportunities for messages about the facts of corruption in health care and the protection of persons providing such information.
- To establish the information, inform the public on the Internet about the budgets of the health sector at all levels of government, including at the level of medical institutions, as well as information on tenders, their organization, terms, conditions, the process of evaluating proposals and the final decision.
- To develop a Code of professional ethics, as well as to approve the list of prohibited activities in medical practice and make it impossible to engage in medical activities.

- To organize a feedback with the population on the problems of bribery, extortion, etc.

Thus, corruption in the health sector is multifaceted. It includes fraud in public procurement, manipulation with setting exaggerated accounts of insurance companies, the manipulation of data on the results of clinical trials of medicinal products, bribery of regulators and medical workers, misuse of pharmaceuticals, bribery. Corruption is also linked to the abuse of the leaders of the powers entrusted to them and stealing valuable resources necessary for the development of the health system and efficient functioning (Zakirova and Dobrotvorskaya, 2012).

Speaking about the development of the market of health services, we should not forget about the main principles: accessibility and equal opportunities in receiving medical care. This strengthens the role of the state in regulating the market of medical services. The state must control the quality of medical services, Finance socially important types of medical care (treatment of tuberculosis, infectious diseases, etc.) (Frolova, 2013).

Thus, if the comprehensive approach taking into accounts all the requirements of the normative-legal base in any institution of the state or municipal health care system is the possibility of providing health care services on a paid basis (European Observatory on Health Care Systems Series). Any citizen has the choice between free treatment and pay systems. Paid medical services are essential element of the development of the health system at the present stage; however, they must meet the requirements of new time and have a qualitative character.

Corresponding Author:

Dr. Frolova Irina Ivanovna
Institute of Economics, Management and Law
(Kazan) branch in Naberezhnye Chelny
Naberezhnochelninskaya street, 31, Naberezhnye
Chelny, 423810, Russia

References

1. Balabanova, T.A., 2011. Causes and conditions of crime in the sphere of health in modern Russia (on materials of criminological research) *Journal of Eurasian law*. 7 (38): 45-67.
2. Zakirova, L.M., 2010. The problem of corruption phenomenon research in the Russian psychology. *Journal Urgent problems of Economics and law*. 4(16): 52-56.
3. Zakirova, L.M., S.G. Dobrotvorskaya, 2012. The assessment of proneness to risk in people with corrupt behavior. *Journal Education and self-development*. 4(32): 154-161.

4. Salagai, O.O., 2009. Combating corruption in the healthcare sphere: political-legal aspect. *Journal Health of the Russian Federation*. 6:3-8.
5. Frolova, I.I., 2008. Corruption in the health sector in Tajikistan: results of the expert poll. *Journal Investigator*. 3: 58-59.
6. Frolova, I.I., 2010. Corruption in higher education: the results of concrete sociological research. *Journal Urgent problems of Economics and law*. 4(16): 147-149.
7. Frolova, I.I., 2012. Corruption in government: an expert poll results. *Journal Urgent problems of Economics and law*. 4: 104-107.
8. Frolova, I.I. 2013. *Quality Management at enterprises (experience of applied research): monograph*. Publishing house "Oil and gas business". pp: 347.
9. Federal law dated 25.12.2008 N 273-FZ (as amended on 30.09.2013) "On combating corruption" - Mode of access: Consultant +
10. European Observatory on Health Care Systems Series. <http://www.eur.who.int>.

7/8/2014