Implementation of international standards to the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan: definition and mechanisms

Yevgeniya Oralova, Aray Rakisheva
Kazakh Humanities and Law University, Astana, Kazakhstan
eugenia_arenova@mail.ru

Abstract. The article is devoted to the consideration of mechanisms and forms of implementation of the international standards in the field of space activities and education sphere to the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. For this purpose, the article provides a comparative analysis of the provisions of international standards and the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Purpose—the authors have tried to define the mechanisms of implementation of international standards applied by the Republic of Kazakhstan. Methodology—theoretical methods, induction and deduction, method of comparative analysis, legalistic method. Value—authors have tried to give the definition of the term “implementation” in doctrine of international law and the analysis of the most widespread ways of implementing of international standards to domestic law in different spheres of public relations. Results—the most widespread implementation mechanisms in the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan are incorporation and transformation. Sometimes specification and reference are also used.


Keywords: implementation, international standards, obligations, domestic law, space activities, education sphere

Introduction
The process of globalization of world economy, growth of interdependence of states, rapprochement of national political and legal systems, interaction of the international and domestic law leads to the harmonious development of the international and national legal systems, ensuring the supremacy of law, formation of international relations system based on international law. This task cannot be effectively solved without creation of national mechanisms of implementation of international law norms.

As an academic topic the implementation of law has been researched more often by scholars in public policy or public administration than by legal scholars. As result, implementation is often conceptualized as pressure politics, a social and political phenomenon, an administrative control process, or an inter-governmental bargaining process. In short, it is more often seen as a political game than a legal issue. However it is conceived, implementation is undoubtedly a very complicated process in the administration of law. This process necessarily includes general policy programs, detailed rules, generally applicable measures and concrete individuals decision by executive organs and other state authorities, as well as the specific enforcement of law and judgements by the judiciary, the legal profession, the police, the other law-enforcement of administrative organizations [1, p.654].

International standards, both customary law and treaty norms, may be implemented or, as Nisuke Ando says, may be interpreted by state organs in all branches of government (legislative, executive, judicial) at any level of governance. The term “implementation” usually indicates acts of legislative or executive organs, while the term “interpreted” indicates acts of judicial organs. The distinction is not always maintained, however, because legislative and executive organs also interpret rules and principles of international human rights law and interpretation by judicial organs may be based on incorporating acts of legislative or executive organs. Consequently, the term “implementation” may embrace “interpretation” as well [2, p.698]

Implementation in doctrine of international law
Today we can meet with the term “implementation” as in the United Nations General Assembly resolutions as in decisions of other international organizations.

As used in UN resolutions and throughout Agenda 21, the term implement or implementation means carrying out or performing out or performing the provisions of the instrument in question or any action (decision, measure, plan, policy or project) taken pursuant thereto. Other common synonyms for implement include: complete and develop.

Implementation of international standards can be viewed in two ways. In a broad sense implementation represents fulfillment of international obligations through different mechanisms, both
international and domestic. In a narrow sense, the implementation should be seen as the introduction of international standards into national legislation by various means and methods.

This article is devoted to the second aspect of the notion of implementation, including consideration of appropriate mechanisms of implementation of international norms into domestic law: transformation, incorporation, reference[3, p.265; 4, pp. 130-131]. In addition to these mechanisms or methods of implementation Witzum also speaks about a specification noting that not all international norms may be applicable in domestic law as enshrined in the treaty [4, p. 132].

If the constitution of the state accords no special status to treaties, the rights and obligations are not given effect to domestic law unless legislation is in form to give effect to them. When the legislation is specifically made for the purpose, the rights and obligations are then said to be “incorporated” into domestic law [5, p.187].

Under the doctrine of incorporation, a rule of international law becomes part of national law without the need for express adoption by the local courts or legislature. The rule of international law is incorporated in national law simply because it is a rule of international law.

The doctrine of transformation, on the other hand, stipulates that rules of international law do not become part of national law until they have been expressly adopted by the State. International law is not ipso facto part of national law. Therefore, a national court cannot apply a particular rule of international law until that particular rule has been deliberately “transformed” into national law in appropriate manner, as by legislation. Consequently, international law and national law are kept separate by the state and it is only if the state has taken the conscious step of utilizing rules of international law that the rules so chosen can be said to be “part of” national law.

In essence, then, the difference between incorporation and transformation is that the former adopts international law into national law just because it is international law, whereas the latter requires a deliberate act on the part of the state concerned. Under the former, rules of international law are part of national law unless excludes, under the latter they are part of national law only if deliberately include[6, p.98].

The doctrine of reference is well-known for the publicists and jurists of the Russian speaking countries. As a special form of implementation of international norms reference represents the case where the law of a particular state provides that in certain circumstances one or another international agreement will be applied. As a result of reference such treaties acquire legal force [3, p.265].

Thus, the aim of the paper is to analyze the examples of implementation of international standards in the field of space activities and education into the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including mechanisms of the implementation.

Implementation of the standards of international obligations in the field of space activities to the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Effectiveness of compliance with international obligations in the field of space activities is achieved inter alia by creating domestic mechanism for their implementation. Such mechanisms include legislative and administrative instruments. Since this article focuses on the implementation of international norms in the narrow sense of the term, we will consider a legislative mechanism to ensure compliance with international obligations in the field of space activities.

The Republic of Kazakhstan in 1997 by enacting laws on accession has undertaken international obligations under all universal conventions on Outer Space Activities: the Treaty on Principles Governing the Activities of States in the Exploration and Use of Outer Space, including the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies, the Agreement on the Rescue of Astronauts, the Return of Astronauts and the Return of Objects Launched into Outer Space, the Convention on International Liability for Damage Caused by Space Objects, the Convention on Registration of Objects Launched into Outer Space, the Agreement Governing the Activities of States on the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies.

It is well known that in the 90s of the 20th century the Republic of Kazakhstan was in formative period as an independent state, which explains some difficulties in questions relating to the conclusion of treaties. During this period the international obligations under a number of multilateral conventions including treaties on outer space activities were taken by the adoption of laws on accession. Since the question of the place of treaties in the hierarchy of normative legal acts is decided by each state independently, it should be noted that in the Republic of Kazakhstan international agreements which ratified only have the priority over the domestic legislation. As a result, two questions were put before the Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan. First, "are there any differences between the law on the ratification of a treaty and the law on accession to a treaty which is subject to ratification" [7]? Secondly, whether the treaties to which Kazakhstan joined by the act of accession but
not by the ratification will have the priority over the domestic legislation? The Constitutional Council in its decision of 18 May 2006 № 2 has determined that the acts of ratification and the acts of accession adopted by the supreme representative body of Kazakhstan are "equivalent in their legal force and legal consequences", and treaties which the Republic of Kazakhstan has agreed to comply with by issuing an instrument of accession shall be equal to the ratified treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan [7]. Thus, the five universal treaties on outer space activities mentioned above take supremacy over the national laws and apply directly. Consequently, these treaties were incorporated into domestic legislation by an act of accession equated to the act of ratification.

Consideration of mechanisms and methods of implementation of international standards in the field of space activities to the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan should be started with the analysis of such legislation.

Despite the fact that Kazakhstan joined the universal treaties on outer space in 1997, the national legislative regulation of Space Activities has begun much later. The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Space Activities" (hereinafter - the Law) was passed on 6 January 2012. The purpose of the Law is to create a legal framework for the regulation of space activities, including activities of individuals and legal entities. Taking into consideration this fact, it is appropriate to appeal to the second sentence of Article VI of the Treaty on Principles Governing the Activities of States in the Exploration and Use of Outer Space, including the Moon and Other Celestial Bodies, adopted by the resolution 2222 (XXI) of the United Nations General Assembly on December 19, 1966 (hereinafter - the Outer Space Treaty). It states that «the activities of non-governmental entities in outerspace, including the Moon and other celestial bodies, shall require authorization and continuing supervision by the appropriate State Party to the Treaty» [8]. It is quite obvious that this obligation is not self-executing and it is necessary to establish the domestic mechanism to ensure its realization. According to Fabio Tronchetti despite «Article VI does not directly require the enactment of national space legislation, but ultimately this has emerged as the optimal solution to govern the authorization and supervision of private activities in outerspace» [9, p. 27]. Thus, Kazakhstan has created a legislative mechanism to supervise the space activities of individuals and legal entities in pursuance of an international obligation under Article VI of the Outer Space Treaty.

It should be noted that Article 2, paragraph 2 of the Law contains a provision stating that "if an treaty ratified by the Republic of Kazakhstan establishes rules different from those contained in this Law, the rules of the international treaty shall be applied" [10]. Such a rule is relevant to provisions of Article 4, paragraph 3 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan and as the form of implementation represents the reference to the existing ratified agreements and future treaties which are subject to ratification. Thus, the legislator initially determined that in case of conflict between the provisions of Law and norms of ratified treaty the last one will have situational superiority, thereby ensuring compliance with international obligations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Continuing to analyze the Law "On Space Activities" we should note that as one of the principles of space activities Article 3 enshrines the principle of compliance with "the rules of international law in the field of space activities" [10]. In our opinion, this principle should not be interpreted too narrowly, considering "the rules of international law in the field of space activities" as treaty rules only. The sources of international obligations in the field of space activities are also international custom «as evidence of a general practice accepted as law» [11] and unilateral declarations of States. Thus, postulating compliance with international law in the Law, the Republic of Kazakhstan guarantees the fulfillment of international treaty, customary and other obligations that, in our opinion, is consistent with the principle of compliance with international obligations good faith, which by the way also reflects customary international law [12]. Furthermore, the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan in Article 4, paragraph 1 states that the applicable law in Kazakhstan includes international treaty and other obligations of our republic [13], thereby confirming our thesis.

An important aspect related to the regulation of space activity is the issue of reglamentation of the registration of objects launched into outer space. In Article VII of the Outer Space Treaty registry of objects launched into outer space is mentioned twice, thus, postulating the need for its creation and maintenance by the State Party to the treaty. January 14, 1975 the United Nations General Assembly adopted resolution 3235 (XXIX), containing the Convention on Registration of Objects Launched into Outer Space (hereinafter - the Convention). Article II, paragraph 1 of the Convention contains two important obligations which essentially constitute the core of the treaty: States parties are obliged to keep a national registry of objects launched into outer space, as well as an obligation to inform the United Nations Secretary-General on the establishment of such a registry. Article II, paragraph 3 states that "the
contents of each registry and the conditions under which it is maintained shall be determined by the State of registry concerned" [14]. These international obligations can not be fulfilled without creating a domestic mechanism. For the compliance with these obligations Article 11 which regulates the procedure of state registration of space objects was included into the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Space Activities”. According to authors of Cologne Commentary on Space Law, «with the adoption of the Law on Space Activity dated 6 January 2012 the Republic of Kazakhstan legally enshrined th emain provisions for national registration of space objects that fall under the scope of its jurisdiction» [15, p.267]. In addition to the Article 11 of the Law on August 27, 2012 The Government of Kazakhstan approved the Rules of state registration of space objects determining the procedure for such registration, the certificate form of state registration and the form of the national registry of space objects [16]. It should be noted that the form of the registry is fully consistent with Article IV of the Convention that regulates the amount of information on a space object, which must contain a national registries. Considered provisions of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan governing the registration of space objects represents a specification of the Convention's rules as one of the mechanisms of implementation of international standards.

Speaking on the implementation of international standards in the field of space activity, it is necessary to note that the Law "On Space Activities" includes Article 30 regulating the prohibitions and restrictions in space activities. In particular it is prohibited in outer space activities to place in orbit around the earth the weapons of mass destruction [10]. This provision implements the norm of the first paragraph of Article IV of the Outer Space Treaty [8]. It should be emphasized that Article 35 of the draft law in 2010 contained this provision and also prohibitions on "the use of space technology as a means of influencing the environment for military or other purposes dangerous to humans" and "the use of celestial bodies for military purposes" [17]. These three prohibitions were in full conformity with the fulfillment of international obligations set forth in Article IV of the Outer Space Treaty. It is unclear why the legislator has left in current law only one of the prohibitions mentioned above.

It should be noted that the Law "On Space Activity" does not regulate the procedure on rescue of astronauts and the return of objects launched into outer space. Agreement on the Rescue of Astronauts, the Return of Astronauts and the Return of Objects Launched into Outer Space, adopted on December 19, 1967 by resolution 2345 (XXII) United Nations General Assembly (hereinafter –the Agreement) contains the obligation of States parties to take "all possible steps" to save the crew of the spacecraft, which appeared as a result of accident, distress, emergency or unintended landing on the territory of the state [18]. Taking into account the fact that the Agreement does not specify concrete steps to rescue the crew of spacecraft, there is a need to define such provisions in national law because of the especial importance of this issue.

The examples of implementation of international obligations particularly in the field of space activities.

Implementation of the international treaties in the sphere of education to the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The system of international legal instruments in education sphere is presented by the Charter of UNESCO, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966), European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950), as amended by Protocols №1 (1952), the European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights (2000), the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). It is necessary to note that all these sources define the term "right to education".

The leading instrument among those is the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Article26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights defines the right of everyone to education. Moreover, it is prescribed that education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit[19].

The Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights accepted 26 December 1966 also recognizes the right of everyone to education, and defines five directions to the full development of the human personality and the sense of its dignity, and shall strengthen the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms:

(a) Primary education shall be compulsory and available free to all;

(b) Secondary education in its different forms, including technical and vocational secondary education, shall be made generally available and accessible to all by every appropriate means, and in
Article 30 of the Constitution is formulated. Besides, vocational education. In accordance with this Part 1, education in all its forms, including technical and craft education, shall be free and compulsory for all, as well as its development. At the same time as the Declaration of Human Rights and article 13 of Part 1 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights proclaims the right of everyone to education. The activity of any educational establishment must comply with these standards in education. The activity of any educational establishment must comply with these standards [21].

In the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan the right to education is recognized as natural and inalienable one among other human rights and freedoms. These constitutional rights belong to every person full and protected by the state. Everyone, regardless of gender, ethnicity, social background and abilities, has rights to gain secondary education.

Article 30 of the Republic of Kazakhstan fixed the common issues of the right to education:

1. The citizens shall be guaranteed free secondary education in state educational establishments. Secondary education shall be obligatory.

2. A citizen shall have the right to receive on a competitive basis a higher education in a state higher educational establishment.

3. The citizens shall have the right to pay and receive an education in private educational establishments on the basis and terms established by law.

4. The state shall set uniform compulsory standards in education. The activity of any educational establishment must comply with these standards [21].

As we can see that the rules of international law have been implemented in the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Thus, the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as Article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and article 13 of Part 1 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights proclaims the right of everyone to education. At the same time as the Declaration and the Covenant is formulated. Besides, the Declaration and the Covenant provides that higher education shall be equally accessible to everyone on the basis of capacity. Under the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan the ability of each to higher education are determined on a competitive basis.

One of the important instruments of educational spaces is the Convention on the Rights of the Child ratified by Kazakhstan in 1994, the legal consequence of which was the adoption of the “Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan about the rights of the child in the Republic of Kazakhstan” in 2002.

Under the Convention States Parties shall undertake all appropriate legislative, administrative, and other measures for the implementation of the rights to education (article 4).

Article 28 provides the right to education, to educational and vocational information and guidance available and accessible to all children. According to article 29 States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to the development of the child’s personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential; the development of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; the development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own; the preparation of the child for responsible life in a free society, in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of sexes, and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin; the development of respect for the natural environment. Moreover article 23 recognized the a mentally or physically disabled child should enjoy a full and decent life and be provided (free of charge, whenever possible) with the effective access to the service in the sphere of education [22].

Through a comparative analysis of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "About the rights of the child in the Republic of Kazakhstan" it may be noted that the principles on which the Convention is based have found their expression in the law. Thus, in accordance with Article 15 of the Law a child has right for free primary, secondary and vocational education. Funds for the state budget to ensure the education of children with disabilities are allocated (Article 15 paragraph 3) which are corresponded to his/her mental and physical abilities and desires (Article 31 paragraph 2). The state also provides children with the opportunity of familiarizing to the history, traditions and spiritual
values of the people of Kazakhstan and world culture achievements, encourages the development of creative and scientific abilities of children (Article 34§1, 2) [23].

In the national legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan the right to education is provided by the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, the government provides the citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan with free preschool, primary, secondary education, as well as with free technical and vocational, higher and postgraduate education if the education of each of these levels is gaining for the first time by the participant, on a competitive basis in accordance with the state educational order [24]. As we can these provisions are consistent with the international legal instruments in the field of education. Besides under the Law pre-school education is also charge of free.

On the March 11, 2010 with the decision of the Committee of Ministers of Education of the Bologna process states Kazakhstan joined the Bologna process. The reforming of higher education under the Bologna process is one of the most important issue in the sphere of education.

Let’s consider the process of implementation of certain key provisions of the Bologna Declaration, defining the foundation of the European higher education to the national legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

First action - multilevel education: first level - Bachelor's (degree of "Bachelor"); second level - Master's (degree of "Master"); third level - Doctorate (degree of "doctor"). This provision is fully implemented in the national legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with Article 21 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" professional higher education curricula shall be aimed to train specialists with the qualification and/or Bachelor's degree awarded to them, and post-graduate education shall be acquired through master's and doctoral studies at higher education institutions in accordance with Article 36 of the Law.

Second action - establishment a system of credits (an academic unit from 30 to 40 hours, including classroom and independent work-the volume which is equal to educational work of student per week). This provision (credit-an unified unit of training volume of a learner/teacher) is reflected in Article 5 of the Law "On Education" and in the Regulations of the educational process under a Credit Transfer System from April 20, 2011.

Third action declares the necessity of mobility of students and teachers – the access to education and training as well as to services related to it with the recognition of periods used in Europe for research, teaching and training [25]. This provision corresponds to Article 1 of the Law "On Education", which says that academic mobility shall refer to moving students or teachers and researchers to study or do their research for a particular academic period, a semester or academic year, to another higher education institution (within the country or abroad) with obligatory transfer of credits for education programmers mastered in their higher education institution, or to continue studies at another institution of higher education.

Conclusion
The term ‘implementation’ is used in reference to actual compliance with human rights standards by individual states as well as all initiatives taken by those states themselves, other states and international organs or other bodies to enhance respect for human rights and prevent violations.

The term implementation implies the intent of fulfilling the purpose of the rule, whilst applying or observing a rule merely has the connotation of doing what you are told to do [26, p.3].

The implementation of various international obligations requires different mechanisms of their implementation to domestic legislation. Analysis of normative legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan shows that the legislator uses a wide range of mechanisms and forms of implementation of international standards. Compliance with the international obligation, adequate regulation of public relations in different fields, ensuring the protection of human rights depends on the properly maintaining implementation mechanism of international norms, including transformation, incorporation and specification.

Corresponding Author:
Dr. Oralova Yevgeniya
Kazakh Humanities and Law University, Astana, Kazakhstan
eugenia_arenova@mail.ru

References
10. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Space Activity” of 06.01.2012 Volume № 528-IV.
15. Hobe, S., B. Schmidt-Tedd, K. Schrogl, Heymann, 2013. Cologne commentary on space law: Rescue agreement; Liability convention; Registration convention; Moon agreement, pp: 447 pages.

7/4/2014